Evaluating the Candidate Pool

- As you begin to evaluate applicants and candidates, be aware of the kinds of evaluation biases that psychological and sociological research has identified in the search committee processes. You may want to review Virginia Valian’s summary of this research (see http://facultydevelopment.cornell.edu/library.html) and discuss it as a group. The most important general point about the process of creating the short list is to build in several checkpoints at which you make a considered decision about whether you are satisfied with the pool of candidates you have generated.

- Include all committee members in the evaluation process. No application should have just one reader.

- Use predetermined selection criteria to rate applications on minimum and preferred qualifications. Not all candidates will have the same strengths across the selection criteria: consider creating separate short lists ranking people on different criteria (such as teaching, research potential, mentoring capacity, etc.). Develop your final shortlist by taking the top candidates across different criteria. Evaluate this step before finalizing the list; consider whether evaluation bias may still be affecting your choices.

- Plan to interview more than one member of an underrepresented group (base on gender or race). Interviewers evaluate underrepresented candidates more fairly when there is more than one candidate in the interview pool. When there is only one underrepresented candidate, s/he is far less likely to succeed than candidates who are compared to a mixed-gender or mixed race pool of candidates, probably because of the heightened salience of their gender/race. [for more on this, read Valian, Virginia. (1999). *Why So Slow? The Advancement of Women.* Cambridge, Mass.: The MIT Press, especially chapter 7.]

- Prepare written de-selection documents that describe the reason(s) for rejecting candidates. Deans or associate deans and department chairs should review these documents and may examine committee selections to ensure that they meet the selection criteria listed in the position announcement.

- Notify those not selected for further consideration.